



City of Santa Barbara

Public Works Department

www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

August 17, 2009

Main Office

630 Garden Street
P.O. Box 1990
Santa Barbara, CA
93102-1990

Administration

Tel: 805.564.5377
Fax: 805.897.2613

Engineering

Tel: 805.564.5363
Fax: 805.564.5467

Facilities

Tel: 805.564.5415
Fax: 805.897.2577

Street Maintenance

Tel: 805.564.5413
Fax: 805.897.1991

Transportation

Tel: 805.564.5385
Fax: 805.564.5467

Water Resources

Tel: 805.564.5387
Fax: 805.897.2613

The Honorable J. William McLafferty
Presiding Judge, Superior Court
County of Santa Barbara
1100 Anacapa Street, 2nd Floor
Santa Barbara, California 93101

Santa Barbara County Civil Grand Jury
Attention: Foreman Ted Sten
1100 Anacapa Street
Santa Barbara, California 93101

SUBJECT: Grand Jury Report: *Trapped in the Granada Garage Elevator – Not an Uplifting Experience*

Dear Judge McLafferty and Foreman Sten:

Thank you for your letter to Mayor Marty Blum dated June 3, 2009, requesting a response to the Grand Jury's 2008-2009 report: *Trapped in the Granada Garage Elevator – Not an Uplifting Experience*. The City appreciates the service the Civil Grand Jury provides to our community and has attached a detailed response addressing the Grand Jury's concerns about the Granada Garage Elevator and related items.

This response was prepared by the Public Works Department and has been reviewed and approved by the Mayor and City Council. The Grand Jury's report provided an opportunity for the City to review and enhance its current elevator management program. We hope the Grand Jury is satisfied with the results and actions taken.

Please feel free to contact Browning Allen, Transportation Manager, at (805) 897-2690, or Stephen Wiley, City Attorney, at (805) 564-5326, for any questions concerning the City's response or if you need further information.

Sincerely,

Christine F. Andersen
Public Works Director

VEG/ks

Attachment

c: Marty Blum, Mayor
James L. Armstrong, City Administrator
Stephen P. Wiley, City Attorney
Cyndi Rodriguez, City Clerk Services Manager
Browning Allen, Transportation Manager

**Granada Garage Elevators
Grand Jury Report Response
August 17, 2009**

1) **Finding 1:** The City of Santa Barbara lacks a coherent management plan for its elevator systems.

a) **Response:** The City of Santa Barbara (City) has a plan in place to monitor the maintenance of the City's elevators. The City has a contract with a qualified and certified elevator maintenance company, consistent with the City's purchasing rules. The contract clearly outlines the expectations and responsibilities of the contractor. However, based on input from the Grand Jury, the City has improved the elevator management plan by transferring the administration and oversight of the maintenance contract for elevators in our parking facilities to the Downtown Parking staff. We believe this plan adjustment will improve accountability when repairs are needed.

2) **Recommendation 1a:** That the City of Santa Barbara establish a coherent plan for its elevator systems.

a) **Response:** The City has an elevator maintenance contract with a certified elevator maintenance company. The contract clearly outlines the expectations and responsibilities of the contractor for maintenance of City elevators. (see response to Finding 1)

Recommendation 1b: That the City of Santa Barbara establish a single point of accountability for all elevator operations.

a) **Response:** At the time of the incident(s), the City's Facilities Maintenance Division was responsible for the operation and maintenance of all elevators located within City facilities, including the elevators in the City's parking structures. As noted in response to Finding 1, this responsibility has now been transferred to the Downtown Parking staff in direct response to the Grand Jury Report.

3) **Finding 2:** The City of Santa Barbara does not maintain records of repair work performed by the contractor on the elevators in the City parking structures.

a) **Response:** Both the City and the maintenance contractor maintain records of all inspections, repairs, and maintenance work done by the contractor performing work on the elevators in all City facilities. Attached to this report is a copy of a typical maintenance report prepared by the elevator maintenance contractor (Exhibit A). Based on the input received from the Grand Jury, City staff adjusted the report to specifically include a line item for inspecting the phone. This was previously included in the report under the line item "Car Stop Switch (es)";

however, the elevator emergency phone is now specified as a separate item to ensure that it is inspected.

- 4) **Recommendation 2:** That the City of Santa Barbara maintain records of repair work performed by contractors on elevators in the City parking structures.
 - a) **Response:** The City and the maintenance contractor maintain records of all repair and maintenance work done by the contractor performing work on the elevators in the all City facilities. As indicated above in response to Finding 2, the City has required the contractor to make a special note to test all City elevators' emergency phones so that the Downtown Parking staff can ensure that they are operational.
- 5) **Finding 3:** The audible alarm system in the Granada Garage elevators has limited range.
 - a) **Response:** The alarm system in every City elevator is installed per the industry safety standard. They are checked each month by the City's contractor, and annually by the State Inspector.
- 6) **Recommendation 3:** That the alarm system be modified to directly alert a responsible agency.
 - a) **Response:** The alarm system in every City elevator is installed per the industry standard. Modifying the alarm is not a solution for notifying emergency personnel of a problem in an elevator. The emergency telephone in each elevator connects the elevator passenger with a dispatcher who is available 24 hours per day and is trained to handle emergency situations. The dispatcher is directed to follow City elevator emergency protocols. As noted above, the City has adjusted the management plan and maintenance protocol to better ensure that the elevator emergency phones are working properly.
- 7) **Finding 4:** The emergency phone is not inspected regularly.
 - a) **Response:** The emergency phones are checked each month by the City's elevator maintenance contractor and annually by the State Inspector.
- 8) **Recommendation 4:** That the City of Santa Barbara perform and document weekly inspections and verify that the phones in all elevators are operational.
 - a) **Response:** The City contracts with a State-certified elevator maintenance contractor who performs monthly inspections of all City elevators, including all safety-related features such as the emergency phones. The contractor has a maintenance checklist (Exhibit A, page 2) that the field technician fills out when the inspection/maintenance is

performed. As noted above, Downtown Parking staff has directed the elevator maintenance contractor to add specific documentation on their reports to show that the phones are being tested.

- 9) **Finding 5:** The City of Santa Barbara has no established written protocol for responding to elevator malfunctions.
- a) **Response:** The City has established protocols for responding to emergencies. The December 5, 2008, incident provided the City an opportunity to review those protocols and institute revisions that will improve specific procedures and response times. The revised protocols have been reviewed by the City's Public Works Facilities Division and Fire Department. The City now contracts with an independent answering service to answer the elevator telephones. The answering service follows the City's protocols in responding to elevator emergencies.
- 10) **Recommendation 5:** That the City of Santa Barbara establish a written protocol for any elevator malfunctions.
- a) **Response:** The City of Santa Barbara has established protocols for responding to emergencies (See response to Finding 5 above).
- 11) **Finding 6:** The City of Santa Barbara has no incident reporting system to address elevator malfunctions.
- a) **Response:** The Downtown Parking Program incident reporting system has been in place for over 10 years and is completed by the on-duty Parking Coordinator or Lead Maintenance Worker for incidents occurring in Downtown parking lots (Exhibit B). The report is reviewed by the Maintenance Supervisor or Parking Operations Supervisor and, if warranted, appropriate corrective action is taken.
- 12) **Recommendation 6:** That the City of Santa Barbara implement an incident reporting system.
- a) **Response:** The Downtown Parking Program incident reporting system has been in place for over 10 years and is completed by the on-duty Parking Coordinator or Lead Maintenance Worker for incidents occurring in Downtown parking lots (See response to Finding 6 above).
- 13) **Finding 7:** State of California Inspection Certificates in the elevators were out of date.
- a) **Response:** The State of California Department of Industrial Relations performs the annual inspections of all City elevators. The certificate renewals are posted as soon as they are received from the State.

The State is solely responsible for scheduling the inspections and issuing the annual elevator certificate. Any required repair work is coordinated between the elevator contractor and the State's inspector,

and the permits are then issued once all work has been completed to the satisfaction of the State.

- 14) **Recommendation 7:** That current State of California Inspection Certificates be displayed in elevators upon receipt.
 - a) **Response:** The City is committed to posting the inspection certificates immediately following/or upon receipt from the State of California Department of Industrial Relations.
- 15) **Finding 8:** The physical address of the elevator is not posted in all elevator cars.
 - a) **Response:** The physical address is shown on the State certificate in each elevator car.
- 16) **Recommendation 8:** That the City of Santa Barbara post elevator locations inside all elevator cars.
 - a) **Response:** The physical address is shown on the State-issued certificate in each elevator car. Additionally, the dispatcher who answers an emergency call from an elevator telephone has the ability to identify the elevator in question.

TEAM Service

Hydraulic Elevator Maintenance Tasks & Records

JOBSITE INFORMATION 2009

Job Name: PARKING LOT #
 Job Address: 1115 RIVER ST
 Route/Contract #: 300-278207 Elevator # 2 of 2
 Contract Type: Platinum Premier Platinum Gold Bronze
 Building Manager/Supt.: _____ Location: _____
 Phone Number: _____ Ext.: _____
 Building Engineer: _____ Location: _____
 Phone Number: _____ Ext.: _____

EQUIPMENT DATA

Elevator # 2, State Installation # 51045, Unit Serial # _____
 Original Manufacturer: OW Controller Mfg.: _____
 Controller Name & Model: _____
 Controller Type: Simplex Duplex Group Other _____
 Landings/Opening: 44 Valve Mfg. Model: _____
 Door Equipment Mfg.: _____ Model: _____
 Pump Motor Mfg. & Model: _____ HP _____ Voltage: _____
 Supply Voltage: _____ Pump Mfg. & Model: _____ Belted _____
 Submersible: Main Piston Mfg.: _____ Packing Type & Sizes _____

The frequency of periodic inspections and tests are established by ASME A17.1-2007 (8.11.1.3 Periodic Inspection and Test Frequency) and may be superseded by your local authority having jurisdiction.

HYDRAULIC MAINTENANCE TASKS

Printed Name _____

For the Year 2009 and

Month Starting 1/09

LTB/LTB LTB/LTB LTB/LTB LTB/LTB LTB/LTB

Assigned Number	LTB/LTB	LTB/LTB	LTB/LTB	LTB/LTB	LTB/LTB				
Clean and Inspect Machine Room				F	F				
Stopping Accuracy + or - [0.5 in]				-	-				
Door Close Force [Torque] <30 lbf. #									
Car Door Reopening Devices				-	-				
Car Door, Gate Equipment, and Operator				-	-				
Car Stop Switch(es), Emer. Communications, Signals/Buttons, Alarm (Optional Switch/ Buttons), Emer. Light and Ventilation				-	-				
Clean and Inspect Car Top and Devices				F	F				
Top of Car Operating [Insp.] Device, Incl. Stop Switch, and Light				-	-				
Car Top Guide Shoes/Roller Guides				-	-				
Leveling Devices/Hardware				-	-				
Hoistway Doors, Tracks, and Door Locks				-	-				
Pit Lighting, Stop Switch, Clean and Inspect Pit				F	F				
Jack/Packing and Oil Recovery Device				NT	NT				
Car Bottom Guide Shoes/Roller Guides				-	-				
Power Unit Oil Level/Condition, Oil Leaks, and Belt Tension				-	-				
Motor Starter Contacts/Connections				NT					
Traveling Cable[s]				-	-				
Car Safety Device									
Overhead, Car Top, and Hoisting Sheaves									
Directional/Final Limits				-	-				
Clean and Inspect Hoistway									
Oil Lines, Supports, and Spring Buffers				-	-				
Power Supplies				-	-				
Motor Lubrication [Dry Unit]									
Valve Strainers									
Door Close Kinetic Energy									
Additional Items									

As required, inspect, observe, and adjust/maintain

Additional Items

PHONE

✓ ✓ ✓ - -



City of Santa Barbara Downtown Parking Incident Report (805) 564-5656



Date of Incident: _____ Time: _____ am / pm

Weather: _____

Location: _____

Description of events: (Who, What, When, Where)

Mr./Ms./Mrs.: _____

Address: _____

Phone #: (home): _____ (work): _____ (cell): _____

Vehicle Description: _____

Witnesses: _____

Operator on duty: _____

Report Taken By: _____ Date: _____

Police Notified? _____ Report/Case #: _____

Photos Taken: _____

Supervisor Notified: _____ Date/Time of Notification: _____

Action Taken (Investigation/corrective action/letters sent): _____

Reviewed by: _____

Dion Tait, Parking Supervisor